



CONSULTATION ON TEACHER TRAINING
FOR HEALTH PERSONNEL

Geneva, 6-10 October 1969



INDEXED

EUROPEAN ASPECTS OF TEACHER TRAINING PROGRAMMES

by

WHO Secretariat (EURO)

1. Introduction

The European Region of WHO is fairly heterogeneous as far as economic, social and cultural development is concerned. The same is true for medical education. All in all, there are half a million students in 285 medical schools and one million doctors serving in various capacities. In 1965 the ratio of physicians to the general population ranged from one per 12 120 population in Morocco to one per 480 population in the USSR. In this Region the approach to the problem of teacher training differs from one country to another and even from one medical school to another. However, in spite of the fact that there are half a million students, not enough consideration is being given to teaching.

Although the systems analysis approach to the problem of teacher training implies considering at the same time all teachers of health personnel, owing to lack of information on other types of teachers, reference in this paper is made only to medical teachers.

In medical schools the main concern of the medical teacher is research, as this is by far the major factor in a successful career. The second is the service which is connected with social pressures and practical and economic needs. Teaching itself is the least of the three main fields of concern in medical schools.

Only recently, and particularly during 1968, owing to the educational demands of students and of some groups of teachers, have teaching activities become of greater concern to universities and medical schools. It may be, then, that the development of education and training in Europe is at the crossroads. There is certainly a growing need to respond to these demands by teaching our medical teachers to teach.

The balance between research, teaching and service seems to be on the way to being re-established as a first step towards improvement. The summary report of the Technical Discussions on "Current trends in undergraduate medical education" held by the WHO Regional Committee for Europe at Varna in 1968 stated that "medical teachers should receive training in medical pedagogy and that should be reinforced by refresher courses. Old-fashioned examination methods needed replacing by objective methods of evaluation which assessed not only the students' progress, but also the effectiveness of teachers and the suitability of courses. Medical faculties must define educational objectives so the faculties and students were clear about them and proper evaluation could be carried out".

The issue of this document does not constitute formal publication. It should not be reviewed, abstracted or quoted without the agreement of the World Health Organization. Authors alone are responsible for views expressed in signed articles.

Ce document ne constitue pas une publication. Il ne doit faire l'objet d'aucun compte rendu ou résumé ni d'aucune citation sans l'autorisation de l'Organisation Mondiale de la Santé. Les opinions exprimées dans les articles signés n'engagent que leurs auteurs.

2. Some data

The Regional Office for Europe recently collected data concerning education from the different health professions. The table in Annex 1 gives data on the number of students, schools and medical teachers. Out of 33 Member States data are available for medical teachers from only 18 countries. In Albania there are 25 medical teaching staff, whilst in the USSR the number is 35 131. Data concerning teachers for other kinds of health personnel are not available at all.

The pattern of academic hierarchy in Europe is quite complicated. The more common structure is six steps, starting from junior assistant through senior assistant, adjunkt, "dozent", extra-ordinary professor to ordinary professor. In some countries, however, the structure is less complicated and there are only four steps: lecturer, senior lecturer, reader, professor. Relations between groups of teachers are traditional, reflecting often the social structure of past centuries.

The Regional Office for Europe is giving limited assistance to Member States of the Region with a view to developing their own resources in the field of education and training. A list of activities is attached (Annex 2). However, in 1969 a special ad hoc programme for medical teachers was initiated and five seminars were held on evaluation in medical education. One of these organized was for the Scandinavian countries and the others in individual countries.

Data concerning teacher training activities in different medical schools have not yet been collected. However, roughly speaking, continuing teacher training programmes of an organized kind are very limited in medical schools, if they exist at all.

It should be mentioned also that there is more literature on learning as a subject of research in medical education, than there is on teaching. This corresponds probably to the general situation in the field of research on education, teaching representing only a small proportion of the total amount of research being done.

3. Scope and content of WHO teacher training programmes

In the "A comprehensive dictionary of psychological and psychoanalytical terms"¹ the entry "teaching" is defined as "the art of assisting another to learn. It includes the providing of information (instruction) and of appropriate situations, conditions, or activities designed to facilitate learning".

In the writer's view, the above definition would describe teaching better if the words "science and art" were used instead of "art" alone.

Medical education is for a profession and, therefore, the main emphasis has always been placed on professional subject matter. However, this is not the main point of the present discussion, so the question of ability to teach subject matter is omitted and only the "pedagogical aspects" are dealt with. As far as the content of medical teacher training programmes is concerned, the following topics may be of interest to teachers for health personnel:

- (a) cognitive and non-cognitive variables;
- (b) teachers' attitudes;
- (c) communication sciences in education; instruments and media of instruction;

¹ English, H. B. & English, A. C. (1958) New York, Longmans, Green.

- (d) methods of evaluation;
- (e) development of objectives;
- (f) student/teacher relationship;
- (g) group phenomena in education;
- (h) planning education for change;
- (i) conditions which facilitate learning;
- (j) comparative and international education.

There is also great need for a glossary of medical education terms particularly in regard to teacher training.

Besides teaching and the collection of data, research on teacher training warrants support from WHO.

4. The regional function of teacher training programmes

The Working Group on the Future of Medical Education in Europe, which was held in December 1968 in Copenhagen, stated in its report that "teaching staff should receive some instruction on educational theory and teaching methods. There are, unfortunately, very few centres in the whole world where these problems are studied specifically in relation to medicine. Steps should thus be taken either to create departments of medical education within a significant number of medical schools, or to encourage by other appropriate means the critical and objective appraisal and inculcation of teaching methods".¹ In this respect the advisers fully supported the views expressed in the Summary Report on the 1968 Technical Discussions on "Current trends in undergraduate medical education" referred to above. The Working Group also indicated that functional and non-structural approaches to WHO activities in the field of education and training are more suitable for the European Region and they were hesitant to select any "centres of excellence" in Europe.

4.1 Establishment of a glossary

In order to establish proper communication in medical education it would be useful if a glossary of medical education terms were drawn up in the different working languages of WHO. This could best be assisted at headquarters level. Without clear definitions communication between countries and regions is made difficult.

4.2 Collection of basic data and experience

There is no doubt that a medical teacher should always be an outstanding specialist in his own discipline and this seems the basic criterion for selection and interest. However, in addition to this, teaching should be taken into account when selecting a physician or Ph.D. for a university career. At present there is no suitable mechanism to secure this. During a visit to a medical school the writer was requested by a very concerned faculty member that WHO undertake a study on this very subject, since only international prestige could make it possible to introduce pedagogical criteria for the selection of medical teachers. A basic study of this kind would seem to be highly desirable.

Second item for study is the inventory of teaching facilities for a medical school. Teachers may know the facilities at the school where they are actually working, however a comprehensive inventory is not generally available to serve as model for the guidance of medical schools and faculties.

¹ Working Group on the Future of Medical Education in Europe (1969) The future of medical education in Europe. Report, Copenhagen, WHO Regional Office for Europe, unpublished WHO document EURO O207 (7), p. 11.

Thirdly, a careful analysis and a comprehensive assessment of experience in teacher training in the Region needs to be undertaken.

4.3 Supporting national efforts

The first step in promoting teacher training programmes should be the dissemination of international experience to prompt national efforts in this field. Therefore, national meetings, seminars and conferences, not confined to any particular medical school, should be promoted. This would not only provide knowledge and experience in the field, but also change teachers' attitudes.

4.4 Single-topic seminars at country and inter-country levels

This type of activity can be organized by different institutions and international organizations. WHO could provide the necessary "staff". Owing to the differences between countries, only teachers from similar cultural, social and economic background can be brought together at such meetings. Therefore, this type of activity would appear to be of limited value when organized on a scale embracing a WHO Region.

4.5 Regional meetings

International experience could be shared at meetings of this type. However, in such meetings generalization should be of a very high level if they are to be useful to all the participants. Such a degree of generalization would involve the consideration of basic principles and, particularly, of various models of educational activities.

4.6 Individual fellowships

Teachers should receive high priority for fellowships in connexion with the various national and inter-country projects. Such fellowships should be used in the first place to train them in medical pedagogy, not in subject matter alone, though combined training in both might be considered.

5. The health team approach

Although the present paper is mainly concerned with medical teachers, the principle of the health team needs to be applied to our educational activities. Basic studies and extensive planning should precede this new strategy in education and training.

In such a strategy the multidisciplinary approach with teachers of biology, science, sociology and the arts needs to be strongly maintained, for an isolation of the health team teachers may give rise to the same inconveniences as the isolation of an individual teacher.

6. Catalytic action

With the present rapid economic development direct assistance by WHO can be replaced by catalytic action. In Europe the developing countries differ completely from the more developed ones in respect of need for assistance. In this Region with a preponderance of developed countries it is necessary to draw up a structure of centres that will have catalytic action. If their structure is not well-defined no catalytic action may result. Institutions for teacher training and responsible organizations at national level are better suited to become "active centres" than individual medical schools. The catalytic mechanism will help countries to use and develop their existing resources far more fully and rapidly than would be otherwise possible.

ANNEX 1

NUMBER OF SCHOOLS FOR HEALTH PERSONNEL, STUDENTS AND MEDICAL TEACHERS IN EUROPEAN COUNTRIES

Country	Population 1961	Medical ^a		Dental		Pharmacy 1963 ^c		Nursing ^d	Midwifery ^e	Medical teaching staff
		Schools No.	Students Total enrolment 1965 ^f	Schools No.	Students Total enrolment	Schools No.	Students Total enrolment	Schools No.	Schools No.	
Albania	1 607 000	1	980	1	-	1	120			25 (1965)
Algeria	11 000 025	3	1 429	1	-	1		3	3	198 (1968)
Austria	7 081 000	3	7 155	3	186	3	1 067	47	6	1 064 (1965)
Belgium	9 153 000	6	7 367	4	146	4	1 063	61 ^f	14	
Bulgaria	7 867 000	3	7 139	1	636	1	681 ^{g1} 163 ^{g2}		4	
Czechoslovakia	13 654 000	9	11 257	8	1 093	1	1 127		10	
Denmark	4 581 000	3	4 641	2	870	1	705	34	1	559 (1965)
Finland	4 467 000	3	2 461	1	215	2	622	23	1	831 (1967)
France	45 540 000	25	41 658	17	1 928	23	8 273	206	27	
Fed. Rep. Germany	35 426 000	28	33 688	17	2 708	14	9 537	850 app. ^h	28	
Germany, Eastern	17 125 000		10 058 ⁱ							
Greece	8 327 000	2	6 410	1	600	2	699	7	3	312 (1963)
Hungary	9 984 000	4	5 834	1	284	2	914		5	
Iceland	176 000	1	183	1	16	1	14	1	1	26 (1965)
Ireland	2 834 000	5	2 089 ^j	4	438	1	102	54	7	
Italy	49 361 000	23	21 174 ^k	12	950	23	4 149	77	36	770 (1964)
Malta & Gozo	329 000	1	70	1	18	1	38		1	64 (1968)
Morocco	12 000 030	1	427 ^l	-	-			3		
Netherlands	11 480 000	7	8 129	2	730	4	470	271 ^m	3	
Norway	3 585 000	2	1 030	1	280	1	111	30	2	208 (1965)
Poland	29 703 000	10	22 121	8	3 845	7	4 060	258	17	5 288 (1967)
Portugal	8 921 000	3	3 042 ^j	-	-	3	589		4	337 (1967)
Romania	18 403 000	5	5 286	2	798	4	1 090			2 058 (1968)
Spain	30 128 000	11	22 851	1	260	4	3 885		10	995 (1965)
Sweden	7 480 000	5	4 940	3	1 048	1	510	33	2	196 (1968)

Sources:

^a World Health Organization (1963) World Directory of Medical Schools, 3rd ed., Geneva and (1967) Supplement to the World Directory of Medical Schools, Geneva.

^b World Health Organization, Regional Office for Europe (1968) Demography of undergraduate medical education in the Member States of the European Region of the World Health Organization, unpublished draft report EUR/211.18(D).

^c World Health Organization (1968) World Directory of Schools of Pharmacy, 1963, Geneva.

^d International Council of Nurses (1965) National Reports of Member Associations, London.

^e International Federation of Gynaecology and Obstetrics & International Conference of Midwives (1966) Maternity care in the world, Pergamon Press, London.

^f Thirty-six general nursing; three psychiatric nursing; seven paediatric nursing; 15 public health nursing.

^{g1} Regular students.

^{g2} Correspondence students.

^h Six-hundred-and-eighty app. general nursing; 170 sick children's nursing.

ⁱ 1966 figures.

^j 1964 figures.

^k 1964 figures.

^l 1964 figures.

^m Certificate A: 210; Certificate B (mental nursing): 61.

Annex 1

NUMBER OF SCHOOLS FOR HEALTH PERSONNEL, STUDENTS AND MEDICAL TEACHERS IN EUROPEAN COUNTRIES (Continued)

Country	Population 1961	Medical ^a		Dental		Pharmacy 1963 ^c		Nursing ^d	Midwifery ^e	Medical teaching staff
		Schools No.	Students Total enrolment 1963 ^h	Schools No.	Students Total enrolment	Schools No.	Students Total enrolment	Schools No.	Schools No.	
Switzerland	3 362 000	5	5 222 ^f	4	211	3	-	34	10	
Turkey	27 818 000	5	3 628 ^g	1	740	2	955	17		862 (1959)
Union of Soviet Socialist Republics	214 400 000	84	226 600	25	8 036	40	13 718			35 131 (1964)
United Kingdom and Northern Ireland	52 352 000	27	17 140	16	2 973	17	1 125	816 ^h	296	
Yugoslavia	18 402 000	8	9 553	4	2 090	3	1 279		14	1 707 (1967)

Sources (continued):

^a World Health Organization (1963) World Directory of Medical Schools, 3rd ed., Geneva and (1967) Supplement to the World Directory of Medical Schools, Geneva.

^b World Health Organization, Regional Office for Europe (1968) Demography of undergraduates medical education in the Member States of the European Region of the World Health Organization, unpublished draft report EUR/211.18(D).

^c World Health Organization (1966) World Directory of Schools of Pharmacy, 1963, Geneva.

^d International Council of Nurses (1965) National Reports of Member Associations, London.

^e International Federation of Gynaecology and Obstetrics & International Conference of Midwives (1966) Maternity care in the world, Pergamon Press, London.

^f Including medically qualified dentist and veterinarians.

^g 1959 figures.

^h England and Wales: general nursing: 541; sick children's nursing: 24; mental nursing: 126; nursing of mentally sub-normal: 33.

Scotland: general nursing: 36; sick children's nursing: 5; mental nursing: 24; nursing of mentally sub-normal: 7.

ANNEX 2

LIST OF MEETINGS OF THE REGIONAL OFFICE FOR EUROPE IN
THE FIELD OF EDUCATION AND TRAINING OF HEALTH PERSONNEL

<u>EDUCATION AND TRAINING</u>	<u>Languages</u>	<u>Reference</u>
<u>European Study Conference on Undergraduate Training in Hygiene, Preventive Medicine and Social Medicine</u> (Nancy, 1952)	E F S	Mon. No. 34
<u>European Study Conference on Postgraduate Training in Hygiene, Preventive Medicine and Social Medicine</u> (Göteborg, 1953)	E F S	Mon. No. 34
<u>European Conference on Postgraduate Training in Hygiene, Preventive Medicine and Social Medicine</u> (Zagreb, 1956)	E* F*	EURO 22.4
<u>Planning Group for the Preparation of a Training Course on Hospital and Medical Administration</u> (Copenhagen, 1958)	E* F*	EURO 138
<u>Joint FAO/WHO Symposium on Education and Training in Nutrition</u> (Bad Homburg, 1959)	E F	1)
<u>Conference of National Fellowship Officers</u> (Copenhagen, 1960)	E* F*	EURO 193.1
<u>Conference on the Training of the Doctor for his Work in the Community</u> (Edinburgh, 1961)	E* F*	EURO 22.5
<u>European Symposium on Training in Tropical Medicine and Hygiene</u> (Copenhagen, 1962)	E F R**	EURO 110.1

¹ FAO Nutritional Meetings Report Series, No. 26

* Out of print

** Limited number of copies available

Annex 2

<u>EDUCATION AND TRAINING (contd)</u>	<u>Languages</u>	<u>Reference</u>
<u>Meeting of National Fellowships Officers</u> (Copenhagen, 1962)	E* F*	EURO 193.2
<u>Symposium on the Teaching of Statistics</u> <u>to Undergraduate Medical Students in Europe</u> (Geneva, 1962)	E** F R**	EURO 207.1
<u>Symposium on Postgraduate Medical Education</u> <u>in Europe</u> (Prague, 1963)	E* F* R**	EURO 249
<u>Working Group on the Training of Doctors in</u> <u>Health Education</u> (Copenhagen, 1963)	E F R	EURO 225(1)
<u>Symposium on the Teaching of the Preventive</u> <u>Aspects of Medicine in Medical Schools</u> (Nancy, 1964)	E F R	EURO 279
<u>Working Group to Study New Ways and Methods</u> <u>of Improving the Teaching of Anatomy</u> (Uppsala, 1964)	E F** R	EURO 207(Gen)
<u>Symposium on Schools of Public Health in</u> <u>Europe</u> (Rennes, 1964)	E F* R**	EURO 0304
<u>European Conference on Paediatric Education</u> (Berg en Dal, 1965)	E F R	EURO 0277
<u>Symposium on the Education of the Public</u> <u>Health Physician in Relation to his Work in</u> <u>the Community</u> (Lisbon, 1966)	E* F R**	EURO 0337
<u>Symposium on Student Health Services</u> (Cracow, 1966)	E F R	EURO 334

Annex 2

EDUCATION AND TRAINING (contd)

Languages Reference

<u>Working Group on the Teaching of Physiology in Medical Education</u> (Lyons, 1966)	E* F R*	EURO 207(3)
<u>Technical Meeting on the Undergraduate Teaching of Basic Medical Sciences</u> (Copenhagen, 1967)	E F R	EURO 385
<u>Symposium on the Teaching of Epidemiology in Medicine and Public Health</u> (Brussels, 1967)	E F R	EURO 0393
<u>Working Group to Evaluate the Courses in Hospital and Medical Services Administration</u> (Copenhagen, 1967)	E F R	EURO 1380
<u>Working Group on the Future of Medical Education in Europe</u> (Copenhagen, 1968)	E F R	EURO 0207(7)

DENTAL HEALTH

<u>Conference on Undergraduate Dental Education in Europe</u> (Copenhagen, 1968)	E F R	EURO 0343
---	-------------	-----------

HEALTH EDUCATION

<u>Joint WHO/UNESCO European Symposium on the Preparation of Teachers for Health Education</u> (Paris, 1961)	E F	EURO 25.3
<u>Working Group on the Training of Doctors in Health Education</u> (Copenhagen, 1963)	E F R	EURO 225(1)

Annex 2

	<u>Languages</u>	<u>Reference</u>
<u>MATERNAL AND CHILD HEALTH</u>		
<u>Conference on Midwifery Education and Services</u> (Moscow, 1964)	E F R	EURO 265
<u>NURSING AND MIDWIFERY</u>		
<u>Study Group on Basic Nursing Curriculum in</u> <u>Europe</u> (Brussels, 1955)	E F	EURO 86
<u>Conference on Post-Basic Nursing Education in</u> <u>Europe</u> (Peebles, 1956)	E F	EURO 87
<u>Seminar on Nursing Education for Child Care</u> (Vienna, 1960)	E F	EURO 188
<u>Seminar on the Training and Use of Auxiliary</u> <u>Nursing Personnel</u> (El Escorial, 1962)	E F R	EURO 236
<u>Working Group on Evaluation of Nursing Education</u> (Copenhagen, 1968)	E F R	EURO 0342
<u>NUTRITION AND FOOD HYGIENE</u>		
<u>Joint FAO/WHO Symposium on Education and Training</u> <u>in Nutrition</u> (Bad Homburg, 1959)	E F	1)

¹ FAO Nutritional Meetings Report Series, No. 26

Annex 2

PUBLIC HEALTH ADMINISTRATION

Symposium on Schools of Public Health in Europe
(Rennes, 1964)

E
F
R

EURO 304

Symposium on Methods of Estimating Health Manpower
(Budapest, 1968)

E
F
R

EURO 0289

ENVIRONMENTAL HEALTH

Symposium on the Education and Training of Sanitary Engineers in Europe
(Oxford, 1955)

E
F
R

Mon. No. 32

The Teaching of Public Health in Europe
by J.D. Cottrell in collaboration with
B. Kesic & R. Senault (1969) (A revised
up-to-date version of Monograph No. 34)

E
F
R

Mon. No. 58