

*Water supply  
Africa health personnel - L.H.C.  
Car. area*



INTERNATIONAL DRINKING WATER SUPPLY AND SANITATION DECADE

TRAINING OF TRAINERS

A Case Study in Human Resources Development

(derived from the Caribbean Basin Water Management Project)

Environmental Health Technology and Support  
Division of Environmental Health  
World Health Organization  
1211 Genève 27  
Switzerland

Contents

	<u>Page</u>
1. Summary	(i)
2. Basic Data	1
3. Prologue	3
4. The Story	4
5. Epilogue	12

## SUMMARY

Development of human resources for water utilities in ten Eastern Caribbean countries was the objective of the Caribbean Basin Water Management Project, launched in 1975, assisted by the Canadian International Development Agency, the Government of the Netherlands, and implemented by the Pan American Health Organization. An assessment commissioned by the governments of the ten countries, CIDA and PAHO in April 1977, revealed a startling situation: top officials sent on fellowships to North America and Europe received academic education, none as instructors; there was no commitment to train others; no training materials; no delivery system; attrition was high; nobody felt responsible for training; in short, there was no residual effect from the investment in training.

Following the assessment, the project was completely reoriented during the last quarter of 1977. Self-reliance; job and skill oriented training; a multiplier effect; developing local training aids, training as an integral part of management, and evaluation; -- these constituted in essence the new strategies. Of the five major interventions under these strategies, this case study narrates those pertaining to "training of trainers" and "evaluation".

An evaluation carried out in May 1980, revealed that 102 supervisory level personnel from the utilities had been trained as trainers in 1978. Training aids and material were prepared subsequently and the training was carried forward by these trainers in their islands. There were a number of exceedingly important benefits which are not apparent from the statistical data. These accomplishments are the ones that help to set this project apart from traditional ones in manpower development. Attitudes had changed -- right through, from top ministerial level to the lowest level of worker in the utility. Budgets were allocated for training; people were being re-trained; the jobs were performed well, as training was job and skills specific; the personnel were motivated, as the environment in which they now worked was conducive. There were many aspects in the management of the utilities (and in human resources development, as well), that were still deficient, but these have been recognized by the governments and action is being taken to correct them. The satisfying aspect -- and the reason for writing up this case study -- is that a residual effect of the "training of trainers" activity has been left behind and the necessary self-confidence and skills for dealing with the remaining problems are now present in the ten island countries.

## 2. BASIC DATA

- 2.01 Name of Country: Inter-country project. Countries/territories assisted: Anguilla, Antigua, British Virgin Islands, Barbados, Dominica, Grenada, Montserrat, St. Kitts/Nevis, Saint Lucia, St. Vincent.
- 2.02 Title/Number of Project: The Caribbean Basin Water Management Project (CBWMP) -- Project No.: AMRO-2174.
- 2.03 Source of Funds: From the Governments of Canada and the Netherlands, implemented through the Pan American Health Organization (PAHO).<sup>1</sup>
- 2.04 Responsible Government Ministry/Agency:  
The agencies responsible for water supply in each of the ten countries/territories in the Eastern Caribbean.
- 2.05 Type of Project: The CBWMP was a project on Human Resources Development (HRD) for water supply agencies in the ten countries/territories, involving new approaches and comprising essentially of five component activities or interventions:
- (i) Development of a Training Delivery System (TDS);
  - (ii) Training of Trainers;
  - (iii) Development of Training/Job Manuals and Job Aids;
  - (iv) Manager/supervisor Training; and
  - (v) Evaluation.
- 2.06 Overview of the HRD Component: The whole project was on HRD, comprising five component activities as noted in 2.05 above. A radically new approach and strategy to HRD involving: concepts of multiplier effect, performance-oriented training, a system to deliver the training, relevant training and personnel policies providing an optimal environment, and above all, evaluation of the training and of the impact; -- was the essence of the project.
- 2.07 HRD Intervention Highlighted by this Case Study  
This case study deals with the "training of trainers" and "evaluation" components of the project.

The primary objective of the Training of Trainers intervention was to provide technically trained personnel with the necessary communication skills and techniques of instruction required to assist with or carry out training at their own utility as well as to assist with instructional programmes in their specialities at other locations.

The Evaluation was carried out both on the skills acquired and on the impact of the training of trainers activity, as a whole. The skills acquired by trainees (who were trained as trainers) was ascertained by the instructors, immediately after the training of trainer workshops. The impact of the training of trainers activity on the performance of the trainers and on the performance of the utilities as a whole, was ascertained by an independent evaluation team two years later -- in May 1980.

---

<sup>1</sup> PAHO also serves as the Regional office for the Americas (AMRO), of the World Health Organization (WHO).

2. BASIC DATA (cont'd)

2.08 Anticipated Change through the Intervention

- A cadre of trained trainers to be available permanently;
- Trained personnel with knowledge and skills to develop training material;
- Better on-the-job training;
- Training of trainers to be stage-setter for manager/supervisor training.

2.09 Starting Date (for this intervention) : January 1978.

2.10 Completion Date (for this intervention) : May 1978.

Subsequent training activities in the islands continued through later years.

2.11 Sources of Information:

- (i) Revision of the Caribbean Basin Water Management Project (AMRO-2174) -- Assessment and Recommendations, by J. H. Austin, N. F. Carefoot and J. L. Lay, Pan American Health Organization, April 1977.
- (ii) CBWMP -- Impact of Training of Trainers; evaluation report, Pan American Health Organization, May 1980.
- (iii) Water Works Training, A Caribbean Perspective, by Neil Carefoot (paper presented to the World Bank Seminar on training, March 1981).
- (iv) Review of the CBWMP (July 1975 - October 1981) by Neil Carefoot (paper presented to the 12th Annual Caribbean Water Engineer's Conference, October 1981).

2.12 Name of contact for more details

Mr Neil Carefoot, who was Project Manager of CBWMP, can be contacted for further information, at the following address:

Environmental Health Technology and Support  
Division of Environmental Health  
World Health Organization  
Avenue Appia  
1211 Geneva 27  
Switzerland

Alternatively write to:

- (i) Mr G. H. Davila,  
Chief, Environmental Health Protection  
World Health Organization  
Regional Office for the Americas/  
Pan American Sanitary Bureau  
525 - 23rd Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
United States of America
- (ii) Mr O. K. Yhap  
Project Manager  
Caribbean Development Bank  
Barbados

### 3. PROLOGUE

- 3.01 The Case Study. This is a story of development of human resources for community water supply, and specifically on one aspect of that development, namely: the Training of Trainers, that started in January 1978. It is however, pertinent to know what the situation was before, in order to appreciate the impact of the accomplishment arising from the Training of Trainers activity.

The scene of action was in ten countries and territories in the Eastern Caribbean (listed in para. 2.01). The story is about how a situation of lack of perception and commitment and waste of resources invested in training, was turned around to one of optimism, enthusiasm and confidence in the future, through dynamic and innovative approaches and actions with commitment. The story is by no means all rosy -- there are still many unresolved issues -- but enough has been achieved to generate confidence based on cooperative achievement in dealing with some hard core problems, for meeting the challenge of the rest. Of the five interventions mentioned in para. 2.05, this case study deals with the training of trainers and the evaluation.

- 3.02 The Project. The Caribbean Basin Water Management Project (CBWMP) was initiated in mid-1975 as a joint venture of ten participating countries in the Eastern Caribbean with the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) as the main sponsoring and funding agency. The Government of the Netherlands was involved in 1980/1981, in funding the project manager's post and the project was executed through technical cooperation extended by the Pan American Health Organization (which is also the World Health Organization's Regional Office for the Americas). The project's objective, as originally conceived, was the training of water works personnel. But for a break in 1979, the project is still in operation (as of December 1984). It had two distinct phases, between 1975 and 1981: the first extending from July 1975 through December 1977 during which period the approach to water works training was traditional, essentially through fellowships and occasional seminars; and the second from January 1978 onwards, when the project was completely reoriented with specific objectives, strategies and plans of action that were performance-oriented.

- 3.03 The situation before 1978. From the assessment report of April 1977, one can see that in the ten years preceding, a total of at least US\$ 50 Million was invested for the improvement of water supply systems in these countries, almost half of which came from the Canadian International Development Authority (CIDA). It was becoming increasingly apparent that this considerable investment was not yielding the dividends in terms of good water service to the people of these islands. The service to the consumers was most unsatisfactory, the utilities were in poor state of repair and were not financially viable.

To ensure the optimisation and protection of the investment in water works development the Caribbean countries had taken advantage of PAHO and CIDA training opportunities in terms of fellowships, short courses and seminars, etc. Between July 1975 and December 1977, some 50 academic and 80 short term fellowships had been awarded, but the emphasis was on individuals at the top of the utility hierarchy (target groups that represented approximately 4% of the total labour force). The training was commonly academic and knowledge-oriented,

and the benefits of the training were assumed to be positive and apparently nobody felt the need to carry out any evaluation to assess the impact of the training.

The attitude towards training was also a serious constraint. Fellowships were considered more as rewards for services rendered. There was no attempt at generating regional self-reliance in water works training. Due to lack of perception of the benefits of training no funds were allocated by the countries themselves. Of the total number of PAHO and CIDA fellows that were trained in the ten years before 1978 only one had taken it upon himself to initiate some training activities in his home country.

None of the water utilities had a training policy since fellowships were available from the British Development Division (BDD), CIDA, and PAHO, the illusion that training and responsibility for training were separate from the organization's other responsibilities was sustained. Coupled with this, personnel policies covering selection, qualifications, promotion, tenure, etc., antiquated and needed updating. There was no training delivery system, no training materials and aids and no strategy.

The majority of the top level managers and supervisors who had gone on fellowships to receive technical training in one form or another, did not receive any preparation for the role of instructor. In fact, only one had received such instruction. None of the returnees felt that training and imparting the knowledge that they had acquired was part of their responsibility.

The attrition rate was also high. As an example, from five of the countries, 14 senior staff were sent on fellowships involving 182 fellowship months and costing US\$ 218,400 in the period 1970 to 1980. In 1980 it was ascertained that not one of these staff were in the islands. They had emigrated elsewhere. Funds expended on this training was a total loss, as far as the Caribbean countries and CIDA were concerned.

This is where the case study begins.

#### 4. THE STORY

- 4.01 Genesis for Action. The ten participating countries and the two sponsoring agencies were deeply concerned that very little residual was being left for the investment made. Arising from a joint CIDA-PAHO meeting in early 1977, a three man team (consisting of John Austin, Neil Carefoot and John Lay) went on an assessment mission in April of that year to the countries concerned and formulated recommendations. It was agreed at the CIDA/PAHO meeting that the programme should include more than training individuals, if a residual is to be left in the area; that at least a third of the remaining funds should be used for institutional development including preparation of manuals and guides; and a larger percentage of the training of local personnel be done on site or at locally identified institutions. The team was charged with the objective of determining ways and means of improving the training programme and defining short and long range plans. The reorientation of the project essentially followed the recommendations of this assessment.

4.02 Strategies and Plan of Action. The main strategies adopted for the CBWMP from the latter half of 1977, with particular reference to the component of Training of Trainers, can be summed up thus:

- emphasis on achieving a broad multiplier effect at all levels within each utility;
- an optimal mix of procedures such as on-the-job training, local workshop with trainers, short courses within the Caribbean utilizing trainers from the Eastern Caribbean utilities, and if required, a few external fellowships;
- design and implementation of the training based on strategies of TCDC, such as West Indians training West Indians, training being taken to trainees so more can be involved, and development of local training materials to build self-confidence;
- training to be performance-oriented;
- certification of the trained personnel on the basis of an assessment of the skills acquired from the training;
- and an evaluation two years later of employee performance and the impact of the training programme on the organizational effectiveness of the water utilities.<sup>1</sup>

The plan of action for training consisted essentially of the following:

- (i) to develop a self-sustaining training delivery system (TDS) for the water utilities of the Eastern Caribbean making optimum use of appropriate existing institutions and technical expertise;
- (ii) to train trainers by providing technically trained individuals with the communication skills and instructional techniques so that home country training can be substantially increased (covered by this case study);
- (iii) develop appropriate/job manuals focussing on "need to know" rather than "nice to know" information; and
- (iv) stressing manager/supervisor training; and
- (v) evaluation (covered by this case study).

The primary objective of the training of trainers phase of the project was to provide technically trained personnel with the necessary communication skills and instructional techniques required to assist with or carry out training at their own utility as well as to assist with instructional programmes in their specialities at other locations.

It was agreed that an international expert in the development and application of performance-oriented instructional materials would be recruited as a short-term consultant to brief and assist in the training of the four instructors who were to carry out the training of trainers in the ten islands.

---

<sup>1</sup>Training is only one of the factors that would contribute to positive impact on performance of staff and the utility as a whole. Other contributing factors such as a delivery system, budget, personnel and financial policy, etc. -- were also part of the revised strategies of the CBWMP. These, however, are not touched upon in this case study.

The criteria for the selection of the four instructors were that they should be West Indian nationals, experienced instructors, if possible in performance-oriented instruction, and other personal characteristics that would help them work as a close knit team, with flexibility and ability to work in different locations. The plan involved a preliminary workshop, home assignments, briefing and rehearsals for the instructors to develop their materials under the guidance of the senior project staff and the short-term consultant before they started off on their training of trainers assignments in the countries.

Criteria for identifying suitable candidates for the series of training of trainers workshops in the home countries were elaborated and these included the following points:

- a minimum educational requirement;
- candidate appropriate for making substantial contribution to training;
- with enough remaining service time;
- demonstrated ability to improve employee performance.

In addition, it was felt that at least 20% of the participants should be available for occasional short periods to develop instructional materials; that the local training coordinator in each country should be a participant; that a reasonable balance was struck between senior office and senior field staff in the selection of candidates for training as trainers, and to involve the manager of the utility to the maximum extent possible in the training activity.

4.03 Participants. At policy level, the governments of the ten Eastern Caribbean countries and territories, the Canadian Government (through CIDA) and the Pan American Health Organization (PAHO/AMRO) were directly involved in this project since 1975, and were the instrument for the reorientation of the project in 1977.

At the managerial level, the central water authorities of the ten islands and the managers of the water utilities were closely involved in all phases of this project.

The assessment of the April 1977 mission set the stage for the reorientation of the project.

The four West Indian instructors designed the workshops and the instructional materials and carried out the training of trainers. The managers and staff of all the water utilities in the ten countries fully participated in this activity, with commitment.

Collaboration from the Ministries of Education, and the vocational training centres in these countries with the project, was close.

These were the participants in this endeavour.

4.04 Interventions. The recommendations of the April 1977 assessment called for a deliberate departure from traditional approaches to training, that is, those directed toward increasing the trainees knowledge with little or no focus on increasing their performance. The assessment also specifically recommended that performance-oriented instruction and instructional materials be utilized in future training efforts. Steps were initiated to obtain the services of a consultant-expert in the development and application of performance-oriented instruction; he joined the project in January 1978. Four West Indian instructors were selected and given their workshop assignments in the different islands. A meeting was held in December 1977 that provided an opportunity for the staff and the consultants to get acquainted and be briefed thoroughly on the individual and team roles and to discuss the total programme, to develop a curriculum outline of the training of trainers workshops.

Prior to implementing the first workshop in Barbados in mid-January 1978 there were two weeks to develop in detail all of the instructional materials required for the first workshop. And during those two weeks of January each instructor continued work on the preparation of the workshop's lesson topics that had been assigned to him at the December meeting. The specialist in performance-oriented instruction served as a resource person to all four instructors. There was a continuous interchange of ideas. Rehearsal was another technique used prior to the first workshop, each instructor presenting to the project team one of the lessons he would actually be responsible to deliver to the participants and the rest of the team would give a critique. This peer group evaluation provided considerable feedback on improvement of the presentations of each of the instructors.

Additionally, all of the first instructor presentations for each workshop were monitored by members of the project team. The instructors provided information sheets, work sheets and assignment sheets to each of the trainees as handouts for future reference. A package of handout materials had thus to be prepared for each workshop in each country. As the instructors continued with their training activity in the different islands, they also collected information vital to the development of training/job manuals. The workshops in the countries were arranged with a four week intervening period during which time the trainees were working on home study assignments while attending to their normal duties. They had thus the opportunity to apply in their work what they had learnt. During this period a call back mechanism was established with each local training coordinator to allow the instructor to monitor the progress of each trainee. A debriefing meeting was held by the instructors finally in Barbados for a thorough review of the events in the field, and the sharing of new ideas and experiences concerning the training of trainers. Certification criteria had been drafted for performance-oriented instruction.

The training of trainers sessions were restricted to four hours per day to allow for the staff who were supervisors from small utilities to attend to their normal duties during the rest of the time. The training was also broken up into three one week sessions; the three sessions being separated by two four week intervals, in order to provide the time for the trainees to catch up, as they had been out of school many years.

An upper limit of 15 trainees in any one session was maintained in order to ensure good individual interaction between the instructor and the trainee. This was also facilitated by the four instructors going in pairs in two separate itineraries.

4.05 Accomplishments. The summary of performance and achievement in the training of trainers workshops is shown in the following table from which it will be seen that 102 trainees were finally certified which works out at 72% of the 142 who attended the very first workshop. Certificate award criteria -- based on performance -- set the standard for successful completion of the series of workshops.

SUMMARY OF PERFORMANCE AND ACHIEVEMENT  
"TRAINING OF TRAINERS" WORKSHOPS

	Number of Participants			Number Certified	% Certified
	Workshop 1	Workshop 2	Workshop 3		
Anguilla	2	2	2	2	100%
Antigua	11	11	10	10	91%
Barbados	35	29	21	21	60%
BVI	10	cancelled*	cancelled*	0	0%
Dominica	13	12	11	11	84%
Grenada	14	11	11	11	78%
Montserrat	14	14	14	14	100%
St Kitts/Nevis	15	13	9	9	60%
St Lucia	13	11	10	10	77%
St. Vincent	15	15	14	14	93%
<b>TOTALS</b>	<b>142</b>	<b>122</b>	<b>102</b>	<b>102</b>	<b>72%</b>

50 of the 1978 training of trainers graduates received a one week refresher course in 1981 at the request of the Governments concerned. Subsequently, 38 Caribbean nationals developed, with the coaching of the CBWM project staff, waterworks reference materials:

- 15 manuals
- 7 job aids
- 3 guides and
- 2 handbooks

which have been shared with each of the ten participating utilities.

\* The importance of observing the participant selection criteria was highlighted by the experience in BVI. It was learned only after the second workshop was cancelled due to poor turn out and only two home assignments being completed, that the participants, for the most part, did not meet the suggested selection criteria. The majority of the participants selected by the utility did not occupy supervisory positions nor did they measure up academically to the criteria.

In addition, the following specific accomplishments could be listed:

- 35 top level managerial/supervisory staff participated in a one week management workshop;
- 12 trainer/consultants were groomed to conduct middle management training;
- 115 middle management personnel received a series of six follow-up manager/supervisor workshops;
- 20 accounting department personnel in seven countries received in-service training over a period of nine months;
- 11 fellowships of four to six weeks duration were granted for attachments to other utilities;
- 8 supervisors received a one week orientation seminar on leak detection;
- Reference materials worth US\$ 3,000 were provided to the ten participating countries to help build up libraries for the water supply sector. Leak detection equipment worth US\$ 40,000 had been ordered for eight countries.
- Three workshops (one per year) have been held for the ten training coordinators of the participating countries;
- Three evaluation missions were conducted;
- A project newsletter has been printed once a month since March 1980;
- An audio-visual tape has been produced in patois and English to assist with the training of water supply caretakers;
- A four person advisory committee has been meeting with the project manager every six months since January 1980.

It is fair to point out that these accomplishments were facilitated by the Training of Trainers activity, and did not all materialize within the period (up to May 1978) of this activity. In addition, a number of non-quantifiable benefits such as involvement of staff, their commitment, confidence and relevance of their activities were by-products of these accomplishments. These come out as impact in the evaluation in para. 4.06 (iv). Another impact was international recognition. In July 1978 the project was adopted by the Caribbean Ministers of Health as a model for the training of environmental health personnel. During the last quarter of 1978 the CBWM project was nominated by WHO Headquarters Geneva as demonstration site for other developing countries. There have been calls for presentation of papers from project staff and for the training materials from various countries and projects, too numerous to describe in this short narration.

#### 4.06 Evaluation.

(i) Objectives. The general objectives of the evaluation mission was to evaluate the effectiveness of the "training of trainers" workshops in all the participating countries as well as to obtain data to recommend follow-up activities.

The specific objectives were to evaluate:

- the impact of the "training of trainers" at the management and to verify how many of the TDS elements had been brought to reality;
- the effectiveness of the "training of trainers" at the supervisory/trainer level and determine what the main obstacles were; and
- the impact of the "training of trainers" at the subordinate level and determine the prevailing climate for training.

(ii) Methodology. The evaluation was carried out by individual interviews with water utility staff assuring at the same time anonymity of the interviewee in the final report. The interviewees comprised of a mix of managers, supervisor/graduate trainers, supervisor/non-graduate trainers, training coordinators and subordinates. Separate questionnaires were developed for each category. The climate under which the interview was carried out was also recorded. In order to assure that the evaluation team understood the procedure correctly and would apply it uniformly, a training activity for the evaluation team was carried out in the form of a workshop.

(iii) The Mission. The team was composed of five members, Eng. Horst Otterstetter (team leader), Mr Henderson Greenidge, Ms. Sonia Francis, Mr Treverne Yorke and Eng. Garry Penn.

The design, field testing, review, training, data collection and tabulation/report writing phases of the mission lasted 40 days beginning 24 March 1980.

It will be noted that while the evaluation team liaised closely with the project manager and the various staff in the project and were appraised thoroughly of the project objectives and the constraints under which they operated, they were free to come out with findings without any inhibition. None of the members of the evaluation team had a vested interest in making positive remarks and ignoring deficiencies; equally they were compelled to be responsible in making their observations, by the tight briefing and monitoring on their activity by the project staff.

(iv) Findings. The overall findings of the mission vis-à-vis the training of trainers activity was that the effort was a moderate success viewed against the specific objective of the activity. However, the mission concluded that the substantial number of fringe benefits or spin-offs from the series of workshops strengthened the overall accomplishments considerably. The benefits designed from the training of trainers as described by the managers, supervisor/trainers, training coordinators and the subordinates alike, left the mission to conclude that this activity fully justified the expense and the efforts put in. In the specific findings of the mission, narrated below, the positive items are prefixed with a (+) and the negative ones with a (-).

#### Training conducted

(+) The 24 formal courses conducted by the 12 supervisor/trainers; the formal on-the-job training conducted by seven supervisor/trainers; and, the informal on-the-job training sessions conducted by 51 supervisor/trainers represented a significant step forward in the development of a self-sustaining training delivery system for the water works industry of the Eastern Caribbean.

(-) Graduate trainers were however not taking full advantage of their knowledge and skills in implementing performance-oriented rather than knowledge-oriented training.

Changes in attitude

(+) 61% of the subordinates reported positive changes in their superiors attitude.

39% of the subordinates detected no change.

(-) One subordinate (out of the total of 131 interviewed) reported deterioration in his superior's attitude.

Overall the attitudinal change was a positive spin-off.

Benefits to the utilities

(+) Significant benefits to the utilities from the training of trainers activity were recorded in the areas of:

- improved job performance;
- supervisors performance as trainers;
- improved communication between utility staff;
- better job relations;
- better definitions of job responsibilities;
- better staff relationships;
- better work scheduling;
- improved productivity;
- improved customer relationship.

Benefits to supervisor/trainers and subordinates

(+) The most important benefits were in the areas of:

- improved communications;
- improved work planning;
- improved relations with subordinates and with supervisors;
- better assessment of work;
- job responsibility awareness;
- improved attitude towards work;
- exposure to training;
- increased knowledge;
- increased initiative.

Cost

(+) The total cost of the Training of Trainers activity came to less than US\$ 1,000 per trainer trained. By comparison, the more customary external training through fellowships would have been approximately US\$ 4,000 per trainee. (As revealed in the April 1977 assessment, this type of training was not always relevant).

The evaluation mission came to conclusions and recommendations on support for further training, administrative and financial reforms, internal communication, etc., which are not the subject of this case study.

Realization by all the Caribbean countries, CIDA, the Dutch Government and WHO/PAHO concerning the need to reorientate the project along new strategies, their being ready to make the changes, the commitment and hard work of the water utility staff, and the international experts, were positive elements that contributed to the success of the project.

The difficulties in making radical policy changes in one sector (water supply) alone, paucity of funds, and the tendency to slip back when intensive external backing is withdrawn especially when administrators not conversant with the project were to make the decisions, -- there were some negative elements.

The findings narrated above are the summary of interviews with 242 personnel at all levels in the ten island countries with cross-checking and further collation of the questionnaires in the office. It is an evaluation conducted two years after the original training was completed with enough time for the initial enthusiasm to wear off. It is, therefore, assumed that this was as objective an evaluation as is feasible in any project.

(v) Recommendations The findings concerning the 1978 training of trainers workshops provided a great many insights as to the benefits to be derived from that activity and the constraints to deriving maximum benefits. The key factor in determining the development progress within the ten country training delivery system was people. Thus, the recommendations were directed at various groups of personnel within the training delivery system.

The mission also realised that no impact on better performance of the utilities would be achieved by the training of trainers activity alone unless a number of related actions were taken and, thus the recommendations included those related to training policy, personnel policy, administration, finance and management.

To highlight a few examples of the recommendations: the importance of a personnel policy that provides incentives and opportunities for staff to perform optimally was emphasized; specific job descriptions for all posts were to be drawn up; monitoring, supervision and training should be considered as part of the job at every supervisory level; internal communications needed strengthening; specific funding was required for training which would be on a permanent basis.

#### 4. EPILOGUE

The target of the project was that the ten countries should take over the project by 1981.

At the end of this phase of the project in December 1981, a new proposal for the years 1982 to 1984 was prepared wedding the three elements which needed serious attention:

- training delivery systems;
- national manpower development plans (MDPs);
- communications,

These proposals were addressed to a group meeting of representatives of the ten participating countries and to take follow-up action on the recommendations of the evaluation team, which were cristalised in the proposal.

With the help of the Advisory Committee, a cost sharing formula for the ten countries was evolved and agreed to by all ten in February 1982.

After a period of doubt about a regional institution to carry on the project, the Caribbean Development Bank came forward to provide such a base and further activities on the project are now going forward mainly funded and executed by the Governments of the countries involved.

The new project manager is confident that there is now new impetus and strengthened commitment for intensification of the activities of the CBWMP.

The foundation for a self-reliant human resources development programme has been laid and the ten countries concerned can now take up the responsibility with confidence, as the international development cooperation assistance is phased out.