



World Health Organization
Geneva 2004

ANTI-TUBERCULOSIS DRUG RESISTANCE IN THE WORLD

Third Global Report

The WHO/IUATLD Global Project on Anti-tuberculosis
Drug Resistance Surveillance
1999-2002

WHO Library Cataloguing-in-Publication Data

WHO/IUATLD Global Project on Anti-Tuberculosis Drug Resistance Surveillance.
Anti-tuberculosis drug resistance in the world: third global report/
the WHO/IUATLD Global Project on Anti-Tuberculosis Drug Resistance
Surveillance, 1999-2002.

1.Tuberculosis, Multidrug-resistant - epidemiology 2.Drug resistance, Bacterial - statistics
3.Bacteriological techniques 4.Data collection - methods
5.Cross-sectional studies I.Title.

ISBN 92 4 156285 4

(NLM classification: WF 360)

WHO/HTM/TB/2004.343

© World Health Organization 2004

All rights reserved. Publications of the World Health Organization can be obtained from Marketing and Dissemination, World Health Organization, 20 Avenue Appia, 1211 Geneva 27, Switzerland (tel: +41 22 791 2476; fax: +41 22 791 4857; email: bookorders@who.int). Requests for permission to reproduce or translate WHO publications – whether for sale or for noncommercial distribution – should be addressed to Marketing and Dissemination, at the above address (fax: +41 22 791 4806; email: permissions@who.int).

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the World Health Organization concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries. Dotted lines on maps represent approximate border lines for which there may not yet be full agreement.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by the World Health Organization in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

All reasonable precautions have been taken by WHO to verify the information contained in this publication. However, the published material is being distributed without warranty of any kind, either express or implied. The responsibility for the interpretation and use of the material lies with the reader. In no event shall the World Health Organization be liable for damages arising from its use.

Designed and typeset in Italy
Printed in Singapore

WRITING COMMITTEE

Written by:

- Mohamed Abdel Aziz, M.D., M.P.H., M.B.T.Sc., World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
- Abigail Wright, M.P.H., World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
- Aimé De Muynck, Ph.D., M.D., M.P.H., M.Sc., Consultant, World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
- Adalbert Laszlo, Ph.D., World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland

With the contribution of:

- Françoise Portaels, Ph.D., Prince Léopold Tropical Institute Antwerp, Belgium
- Hans L. Rieder, M.D., M.P.H., International Union Against Tuberculosis and Lung Disease (The UNION), Kirchlindach, Switzerland
- Andrea Infuso, M.D., EuroTB, Institut de Veille Sanitaire, Saint-Maurice, France
- Armand Van Deun, M.D., Prince Léopold Tropical Institute, Antwerp, Belgium
- Andrea Luna, M.D., M.P.H., Instituto de Salud Pública de Chile, Santiago, Chile
- Sabine Rüesch-Gerdes, Ph.D., National Reference Centre for Mycobacteria, Borstel, Germany
- Karin Weyer, DSc., Medical Research Council, Pretoria, South Africa
- Francis Drobniowski, Ph.D. Health Protection Agency, Mycobacterium Reference Unit, London, UK
- Rose Liefoghe, M.Sc. Consultant, World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
- Charles Wells, M.D., Division of TB Elimination, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC), Atlanta, GA, USA
- Brian Williams, Ph.D., World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
- Kitty Lambregts, M.D., Ph.D., World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
- Malgorzata Grzemska, M.D., Ph.D., World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
- Paul Nunn, M.D., World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
- Marcos Espinal, M.D., Dr.P.H., M.P.H., World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
- Leopold Blanc, M.D., M.P.H., World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
- Christopher Dye, DPhil, World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland
- Mario Raviglione, M.D., World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland

GLOBAL NETWORK OF SUPRANATIONAL REFERENCE LABORATORIES

- Département de Microbiologie, Unité de Mycobactériologie, Institut de Médecine Tropicale Prince Léopold, *Antwerp, Belgium* (Professor Françoise Portaels) (*Coordinating Centre, 1999-2004*)
- Laboratoire de la Tuberculose, Institut Pasteur d'Algérie-Alger, *Algiers, Algeria* (Dr Fadila Boulahbal)
- Queensland Mycobacterium Reference Laboratory, *Chermside, Australia* (Dr Chris Gilpin)
- National Institute of Public Health, *Prague, Czech Republic* (Dr Marta Havelkova)
- Instituto de Salud Pública de Chile, *Santiago, Chile* (Dr Andrea Luna)
- Centre national de Référence des Mycobacteries, Institut Pasteur, *Paris, France* (Dr Véronique Vincent)
- National Reference Centre for Mycobacteria, Forschungszentrum, *Borstel, Germany*, (Dr Sabine Rüesch-Gerdes)
- Kuratorium Tuberkulose in der Welt e.V., *Gauting, Germany* (Professor Knut Feldmann)
- Tuberculosis Research Centre (TRC), Indian Council of Medical Research, *Chennai, India* (Dr Chinnambedu N. Paramasivan)
- Laboratory of Bacteriology, Istituto Superiore de Sanità, *Rome, Italy* (Dr Graziella Orefici)
- Japan Anti-Tuberculosis Association, *Tokyo, Japan* (Dr Satoshi Mitarai)
- Instituto Nacional de Saúde, *Porto Codex, Portugal* (Dr Maria Filomena Rodrigues)
- Korean Institute of Tuberculosis, *Seoul, Republic of Korea* (Dr Gill-han Bai/ Dr Sang Jae Kim)
- Unit for Tuberculosis Operational and Policy Research, Medical Research Council, *Pretoria, South Africa* (Dr Karin Weyer)
- Servicio de Microbiología, Hospital Universitari Vall d'Hebron, Autonomous University, *Barcelona, Spain* (Dr Nuria Martin-Casabona)
- Swedish Institute for Infectious Disease Control, *Solna, Sweden* (Dr Sven Hoffner)
- National Institute of Public Health and the Environment (RIVM), *Bilthoven, The Netherlands* (Dr Dick van Soolingen)
- Health Protection Agency, Mycobacterium Reference Laboratory Unit, King's College Hospital (Dulwich), *London, United Kingdom* (Dr Francis Drobniowski)
- Mycobacteriology / Tuberculosis Laboratory, Centers for Disease Control and Prevention (CDC) *Atlanta, GA, United States of America* (Dr Beverly Metchock)
- Department of Public Health, Massachusetts State Laboratory Institute, *Boston, MA, United States of America* (Dr Alexander Sloutsky)

CONTRIBUTING MEMBERS OF THE WORKING GROUP

•**Algeria:** Professor Fadila Boulahbal •**Andorra:** Dr Margarida Coll Armangue •**Argentina:** Dr Lucia Barrera, Omar Latini •**Australia:** Dr Richard Lumb •**Austria:** Dr John-Paul Klein •**Belgium:** Dr Maryse Wanlin, Dr An Aerts •**Bosnia and Herzegovina:** Dr Biljana Stefanovic, Professor Zehra Dizdarevic •**Botswana:** Dr Lisa J Nelson, Mr Gasekgale Moalosi, Mr Michael Mwasekaga •**Cambodia:** Dr Onazaki, Dr Kouske Okada •**Canada:** Melissa Phypers, Dr Edward Ellis •**Chile:** Dr Andrea Luna Heine, Dr Rosario Lepe •**China:** Dr Wu Xongrong, Dr Kai Man Kam, Dr Su Ya, Dr Du Changmei, Dr Daniel Chin •**Colombia:** Dr Clara Inés León Franco, Dr Martha Inírida Guerrero, Dr Claudia Sierra, Dr Nancy Naranjo, Dr Maria Consuelo Garzón •**Croatia:** Dr Ira Gjenero Margan •**Cuba:** Dr Ernesto Montoro, Dr Mária J. Llanes, Lic. Dihadenys Lemus •**Czech Republic:** Dr Vlasta Mazánková, Mr Jiri Holub •**Democratic Republic of Congo:** Professor Françoise Portaels, Dr Henrietta Wembanyama •**Ecuador:** Dr Judith Vaca, Dr Dolores Kuffo •**Egypt:** Dr Essam Elmoghazy •**El Salvador:** Dr Julio Garay Ramos •**Estonia:** Dr Vahur Hollo •**Finland:** Dr Petri Ruutu •**France:** Dr Bénédicte Decludt, Jerome Robert •**Georgia:** Professor George Khechinashvili •**Germany:** Dr Walter Haas, Dr Michael Forßbohm •**Honduras:** Dr Noemi Paz de Zavala, Dr Hilda Membreño •**Iceland:** Dr Blöndal Thorsteinn •**India:** Dr Chinnabedu Paramasivan, Dr Lakhbir Singh Chauhan, Dr Reuben Granich •**Ireland:** Dr Joan O'Donnell •**Israel:** Dr Daniel Chemtob, Dr Zohar Mor •**Italy:** Dr Dina Caraffa de Stefano, Dr GB Migliori •**Japan:** Dr Chyoji Abe •**Kazakhstan:** Dr Rimma Agzamova, Dr Galemzhan Borankulovich Rakishev •**Latvia:** Dr Janis Leimans •**Lithuania:** Dr Edith Davidaciené, Dr Anaida Sosnovskaja, Dr Puneet Dewan •**Luxembourg:** Dr Pierrette Huberty-Krau, Dr Nobert Charlé •**Malta:** Dr Malcolm P Micallef •**Mongolia:** Dr Gombagaram Tsogt, Dr Naranbat Nymadawa •**Nepal:** Dr Dirgh Singh Bam, Dr Christian Gunnenburg •**Netherlands:** Dr Paul van Gerven, Dr Nico Kalisvaart •**New Zealand:** Dr Helen Heffernan •**Norway:** Dr Einar Heldal, Dr Brita Winje Askeland •**Oman:** Dr Suleiman Al-Busaidy •**Poland:** Dr Maria Korzeniewska-Kosela •**Puerto Rico:** Dr Ada Martinez •**Qatar:** Dr Zubaida Daham F. Al-Suwaidi •**Russian Federation (Orel):** Dr Paul Arguin, Dr Evgenia Nemtsova, Dr Boris Kazzeony, Helen Kiryanova •**Russian Federation (Tomsk):** Dr Irena Gelmananova, Dr Donna Barry, Professor Mikhail I. Perelman, Olga Sirotkina, Vera Pavlova •**San Marino:** Dr Antonella Sorcinelli •**Serbia and Montenegro:** Professor Dusan Popovac, Dr Radmila Curcic •**Singapore:** Dr Cynthia Chee •**Slovakia:** Dr Eva Rajecova, Dr Ivan Solovic •**Slovenia:** Professor Jurij Sorli •**South Africa:** Dr Karin Weyer •**Spain (Barcelona):** Dr Nuria Martin-Casabona •**Spain (Galicia):** Dr Elena Cruz Ferro, Dr Emma Fernández Nogueira, Dr María Luisa Pérez del Molino Bernal •**Sweden:** Dr Victoria Romanus •**Switzerland:** Dr Peter Helbling, Dr Ekkehardt Altpeter •**Thailand:** Dr Dhanida Rienthong •**The Gambia:** Dr Richard Adegbola, Dr Francis Drobniowski •**Turkmenistan:** Dr Babakuli Jumaev MSF, Dr Ashir Ovezov •**United Kingdom (England, Wales and Northern Ireland):** Dr John Watson, Dr Alistair Story, Dr Delphine Antoine •**Scotland:** Dr Jim McMenamin, Dr Fiona Johnston •**United States of America:** Dr Marisa Moore •**Uruguay:** Dr Valentin Cuesta, Dr Jorge Rodriguez •**Uzbekistan:** Dr Helen Cox, Dr Gulnoz Tulkunovna Uzakova, Dr Roy Male •**Venezuela:** Dr Raimond Armengol, Dr Albina Vasquez •**Zambia:** Dr Vincent Tihon •**WHO Regional Offices:** •**Africa:** Dr Daniel Kibuga, Dr Eugene Nyarko •**The Americas:** Dr Rodolfo Rodriguez Cruz, Dr Pilar Ramon-Pardo •**Eastern Mediterranean:** Dr Akihiro Seita, Dr Samiha Baghdadi •**Europe:** Dr Richard Zaleskis, Mr Jerod Scholten •**South-East Asia:** Dr Jai P. Narain, Dr Nani Nair •**Western Pacific:** Dr Dongil Ahn, Dr Marcus Hodge



ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

This project was in part financially supported by the United States Agency for International Development. The Tuberculosis Coalition for Technical Assistance (TBCTA) funded laboratory training activities associated with this project. We are grateful to EuroTB for their participation and contribution of European drug resistance surveillance data. This project could not have succeeded without the support of national authorities and the institutions hosting each of the national and international laboratories. A special acknowledgement is due to Dan Bleed and Mehran Hosseini for technical support of data management.

CONTENTS

FOREWORD	13
SUMMARY	15
1. BACKGROUND AND METHODS	15
2. RESULTS	15
2.1 Magnitude and trends of anti-TB drug resistance.....	15
<i>New cases</i>	15
<i>Previously treated cases</i>	16
<i>Association of drug resistance with the quality of TB control</i>	16
2.2 MDR-TB.....	16
2.3 Patterns and amplification 1994–2002.....	17
3. CONCLUSIONS	17
3.1 Scale of the epidemic of drug-resistant TB.....	17
4. RECOMMENDATIONS	18
4.1 Management of TB control.....	18
4.2 Surveillance of drug resistance.....	19
1. INTRODUCTION	21
2. BACKGROUND	23
2.1 ANTIMICROBIAL RESISTANCE AND PUBLIC HEALTH.....	23
2.2 MECHANISMS OF ANTI-TB DRUG RESISTANCE AND FACTORS ASSOCIATED WITH ITS EMERGENCE.....	23
2.3 THE THREAT OF DRUG RESISTANCE FOR TB CONTROL.....	24
2.3.1 Increased access to drugs.....	24
2.3.2 HIV.....	25
2.3.3 Private sector.....	25
3. MATERIALS AND METHODS	27
3.1 METHODOLOGICAL FRAMEWORK.....	27
3.2 DEFINITIONS OF DRUG RESISTANCE.....	27
3.2.1 Drug resistance among new cases.....	27
3.2.2 Drug resistance among previously treated cases.....	27
3.2.3 Combined prevalence of drug resistance.....	27
3.3 SURVEY AREAS AND SAMPLING STRATEGIES.....	28
3.3.1 Surveillance terminology and target survey areas.....	29
3.3.2 Sample size and sampling strategies.....	29
3.4 BACTERIOLOGICAL METHODS.....	30
3.5 COLLECTION OF DATA.....	31

3.5.1 Patient eligibility and registration	31
3.5.2 Accuracy of information on prior TB treatment	31
3.5.3 Data management in individual countries.....	31
3.6 STATISTICAL PROCEDURES – DATA ENTRY, CHECKING AND CLEANING.....	32
3.7 STATISTICAL ANALYSIS	32
3.7.1 Phase 3 of the Global Project (most recent data)	32
3.7.2 Dynamics of resistance over time.....	32
3.7.3 Determinants of drug resistance (ecological analysis).....	33
3.7.3.1 Sources of information	33
3.7.3.2 Statistical analysis of the aggregate data	33
3.7.4 MDR projections	34
3.7.5 Patterns of resistance.....	34
3.7.6 Resistance to RMP: a good surrogate marker for MDR?.....	34
3.8 VALIDITY OF THE FINDINGS	35
3.8.1 Selection bias	35
3.8.2 Observation and information bias	35
<i>Test bias.....</i>	<i>35</i>
<i>Representativeness of rates</i>	<i>35</i>
<i>Analysis of trends.....</i>	<i>36</i>
<i>Ecological fallacy.....</i>	<i>36</i>
<i>The estimation of the MDR burden</i>	<i>36</i>
<i>Patterns</i>	<i>36</i>
4. RESULTS	43
4.1 PREVALENCE OF DRUG RESISTANCE	43
4.1.1 Drug resistance among new cases of tuberculosis	43
<i>Any resistance among new cases</i>	<i>44</i>
<i>MDR among new cases.....</i>	<i>46</i>
<i>Resistance among new cases according to number of drugs.....</i>	<i>46</i>
<i>Any resistance among new cases by individual drug.....</i>	<i>48</i>
<i>New cases resistant to INH but susceptible to RMP.....</i>	<i>49</i>
4.1.2 Drug resistance among previously treated cases.....	49
<i>Any resistance among previously treated cases</i>	<i>50</i>
<i>MDR among previously treated cases</i>	<i>52</i>
<i>Resistance among previously treated cases according to number of drugs</i>	<i>52</i>
<i>Resistance among previously treated cases by individual drug.....</i>	<i>54</i>
4.1.3 Combined prevalence of drug resistance	54
<i>Any resistance among combined cases</i>	<i>54</i>
<i>MDR among combined cases</i>	<i>55</i>
<i>Resistance among combined cases according to number of drugs</i>	<i>56</i>
<i>Any resistance among combined cases by individual drug</i>	<i>56</i>
4.2 PREVALENCE OF DRUG RESISTANCE BY REGION.....	57
4.2.1 Drug resistance among new cases.....	57
4.2.2 Drug resistance among previously treated cases.....	58
4.2.3 A closer look at the European Region.....	60
4.3 DYNAMICS OF DRUG RESISTANCE PREVALENCE OVER TIME (1994-2002)	61
4.3.1 Dynamics of drug resistance among new cases.....	62
<i>Dynamics in settings reporting two data points</i>	<i>62</i>
<i>Trends in settings reporting three or more data points</i>	<i>64</i>

4.3.2 Dynamics of drug resistance among previously treated cases	65
<i>Dynamics in settings reporting two data points</i>	66
<i>Trends in settings reporting three or more data points</i>	67
4.3.3 Dynamics of drug resistance among combined cases	67
<i>Dynamics in settings reporting two data points</i>	68
4.4 POTENTIAL DETERMINANTS OF DRUG RESISTANCE	70
4.4.1 Variables included in the ecological analysis	70
4.4.2 Bivariate analysis	72
4.4.3 Multivariate analysis	72
4.5 MAGNITUDE OF THE MDR-TB PROBLEM	73
4.5.1 MDR-TB “hot spots”	73
<i>Dynamics of the hot spots (1994–2002)</i>	74
4.5.2 Burden of MDR-TB	76
4.5.3 Resistance to RMP: a good surrogate marker for MDR?.....	76
4.6 DRUG RESISTANCE PATTERNS	
(i.e. relationships between new and previously treated cases, amplification, and major pathways of drug resistance creation)	78
4.7 PROFICIENCY TESTING IN THE SUPRANATIONAL LABORATORY NETWORK, 1994-2002	82
5. DISCUSSION	83
5.1 MAGNITUDE OF RESISTANCE BY REGION	84
African region	84
Region of the Americas.....	85
Eastern Mediterranean region.....	86
European region	87
South-east Asian region	89
Western Pacific region.....	90
5.2 ECOLOGICAL ANALYSIS	91
5.3 BURDEN OF MDR	91
5.4 SRLN	92
5.5 DRUG RESISTANCE PATTERNS	93
<i>Increase in drug resistance rate</i>	93
<i>Amplification of drug resistance proportions</i>	94
<i>Major drug resistance pathways</i>	94
<i>Implications</i>	94
ANNEXES	95
REFERENCES	133
COUNTRY PROFILES	141

