

THE GARKI PROJECT

Research on the Epidemiology and Control of Malaria in the Sudan Savanna of West Africa

by

L. MOLINEAUX
*Medical Officer,
Research Coordination,
Epidemiology and Training,*

and

G. GRAMICCIA
*Formerly, Chief,
Epidemiological Evaluation
and Assessment,*

*Division of Malaria and Other Parasitic Diseases,
World Health Organization*



WORLD HEALTH ORGANIZATION

GENEVA

1980

ISBN 92 4 156061 4

© World Health Organization 1980

Publications of the World Health Organization enjoy copyright protection in accordance with the provisions of Protocol 2 of the Universal Copyright Convention. For rights of reproduction or translation of WHO publications, in part or *in toto*, application should be made to the Office of Publications, World Health Organization, Geneva, Switzerland. The World Health Organization welcomes such applications.

The designations employed and the presentation of the material in this publication do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of the Secretariat of the World Health Organization concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or of its authorities, or concerning the delimitation of its frontiers or boundaries.

The mention of specific companies or of certain manufacturers' products does not imply that they are endorsed or recommended by the World Health Organization in preference to others of a similar nature that are not mentioned. Errors and omissions excepted, the names of proprietary products are distinguished by initial capital letters.

The authors alone are responsible for the views expressed in this publication.

TYPESET IN ENGLAND
PRINTED IN SWITZERLAND
78/4320/1—6000—ACCENT/ATAR

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1. - Introduction

Chapter 2. - The Study Design and Study Area

Chapter 3. - Control Operations

Chapter 4. - Entomology

Chapter 5. - Parasitology

Chapter 6. - Immunology

Chapter 7. - Abnormal Haemoglobins and ABO Blood Groups

Chapter 8. - Demography

Chapter 9. - Clinical Surveys

Chapter 10. - The Mathematical Model of Transmission

Chapter 11. - Practical Conclusions for the Future of
Malaria Control

- References, Acknowledgements and Appendixes

CONTENTS

	Page
Foreword	11
CHAPTER 1. INTRODUCTION	
Purpose of the publication	15
Previous epidemiological studies and control trials in tropical Africa	17
Rationale of the project	19
Objectives of the project	21
CHAPTER 2. THE STUDY DESIGN AND STUDY AREA	
Study design, variables measured, and methods used	23
Malaria control strategies	23
Project phases and calendar	28
Villages selected for follow-up and villages treated by the various strategies	28
Variables measured, frequency of measurement, and methods used	30
Recording, storage and retrieval of data	33
Services and staffing	34
Area, climate, population.....	35
Orohydrography	35
Climate and vegetation	35
Meteorology	37
Population.....	39
CHAPTER 3. CONTROL OPERATIONS	
Residual spraying	41
Sprayable surfaces.....	41
The spraying operations	42
Operational results: the coverage achieved and the dose applied	42
Administration of drugs	43
Mass distribution of sulfalene-pyrimethamine in 1972-1973	43
Post-intervention drug distributions in 1974-1975	48
Discussion	49
Summary	50

	Page
CHAPTER 4. ENTOMOLOGY	
Anopheline fauna and observations regarding minor species	53
Collections as indices of density	54
Baseline findings	56
Vector density	59
Sporozoite rates and inoculation rates	64
Vector behaviour	66
Age composition and longevity	71
Vectorial capacity	73
Effect of intervention, in particular residual spraying with propoxur	75
Results of the preliminary trial of propoxur	76
Effect of propoxur on vector density	77
Sporozoite rates and inoculation rates	84
Vector behaviour	85
Age composition and longevity	86
Vectorial capacity	86
After-effect of propoxur, after discontinuation of spraying	88
Vector density	88
Sporozoite rates and inoculation rates	90
Vector behaviour	90
Age composition and longevity	92
Bioassay and chemical tests	92
Compact versus scattered settlements	94
<i>Anopheles gambiae</i> and <i>A. arabiensis</i>	95
Discussion	99
The estimation of the vectorial capacity	99
Transmission in Garki and its natural variation	101
The effect of propoxur	101
<i>A. gambiae</i> , <i>A. arabiensis</i> and intraspecific cytogenetic variation	103
Evaluation of insecticidal impact	105
Summary and conclusions	106

	Page
CHAPTER 5. PARASITOLOGY	
Methods	109
Method of blood examination	109
Collection and processing of blood films	111
Parasitology staff	111
Sensitivity and reproducibility of the blood examination method	111
The parasitological indices used	114
Parasitological findings in the absence of intervention	115
Prevalence and density of parasites	115
Incidence and recovery rates (conversion and clearance rates)	125
Relationship between parasitological and entomological findings	131
Mixed infections and the relationship between <i>P. falciparum</i> and <i>P. malariae</i>	134
The intervention phase: parasitological effect of the 3 control strategies	139
Prevalence and density of parasites	139
Incidence and recovery rates (conversion and clearance rates)	148
Relationship between parasitological and entomological findings	151
Mixed infections	151
The post-intervention phase: the resurgence of malaria	153
Prevalence and density of parasites	153
Incidence and recovery rates (conversion and clearance rates)	157
Relationship between parasitological and entomological findings	157
Discussion	159
The parasitological effects of immunity to <i>P. falciparum</i>	159
The effect of the 3 intervention strategies on the epidemiology of <i>P. falciparum</i>	162
The effect of mass drug administration on parasitological immunity to <i>P. falciparum</i>	165

	Page
<i>P. malariae</i> , and its relationship to <i>P. falciparum</i>	167
<i>P. ovale</i>	170
Malaria in males and females	171
Summary	171
 CHAPTER 6. IMMUNOLOGY	
Material and methods	173
Serological results by age, survey and treatment	176
Immunoglobulin G	182
Immunoglobulin M	182
Precipitin (Ouchterlony) test— <i>P. falciparum</i> ...	183
Indirect fluorescent antibody (IFA) test— <i>P. falciparum</i>	183
Indirect fluorescent antibody (IFA) test— <i>P. malariae</i> or <i>P. brasilianum</i>	184
Passive (indirect) haemagglutination (IHA) test— <i>P. falciparum</i>	185
The longitudinal study of infants	185
Definition of 2 populations of infants	185
Immunoglobulin levels	186
Malaria antibody levels	186
Proportion positive by the serological tests	188
Serological results in the newborn in the post-intervention follow-up period	191
Variation by sex	191
Relationship between the results of the same serological test in the same person at the different surveys	191
Relationship between the results of different serological tests in the same person at the same survey	193
Relationship between parasitology and serology ...	194
Method of analysis of the baseline data	194
The precipitin test (<i>P. falciparum</i>) and <i>P. falciparum</i> parasitaemia	196
The IHA- <i>P. knowlesi</i> or IHA- <i>P. falciparum</i> test and <i>P. falciparum</i> parasitaemia	197
The IFA test and homologous parasitaemia	198
Immunoglobulin levels and parasitaemia	198

CONTENTS

	Page
Relationship between parasitological and serological findings during and after the intervention phase	199
Discussion	199
Age and the development of the active immune response in the unprotected population	199
Serological changes in the protected population	202
Serological changes in the post-intervention phase	204
The longitudinal study of infants	204
Comparison between males and females	205
The correlation between different surveys in the same person	206
The correlation between different serological tests in the same person	207
The relationship between serology and parasitology in the individual	207
Sensitivity and specificity of the serological tests.....	210
Summary	211
CHAPTER 7. ABNORMAL HAEMOGLOBINS AND ABO BLOOD GROUPS	
Material and methods	213
Haemoglobin electrophoresis	215
Haemoglobins and genetic fitness	216
Sickle-cell trait and malaria	217
Sickle-cell trait, immunoglobulins and malaria antibodies	218
Immunoglobulins	218
Ouchterlony (precipitin) test with <i>P. falciparum</i> antigen	220
Indirect fluorescent antibody test.....	220
Indirect haemagglutination test with <i>P. falciparum</i> antigen	221
Immunology by sex, tribe and haemoglobin	222
Immunology, malaria parasitology and haemoglobin	222
Findings in the Hb SS persons	222
Findings in the Hb SC person	223

CONTENTS

	Page
Findings in the Hb AC persons	223
ABO blood groups and malaria	224
Discussion	224
Haemoglobin genotype frequencies, fitness, and parasitology	224
Serology of the Hb AA and Hb AS	226
The Hb SS	227
The Hb AC	227
The ABO blood groups and malaria	228
Summary	228
 CHAPTER 8. DEMOGRAPHY	
Methods	231
Demographic and parasitological (DP) surveys	232
Local registrars (pataucis).....	232
Data-handling	232
Results	233
Distribution of the population by age and sex	233
Births	234
Deaths	236
Population movements.....	241
Demographic analysis of the MDA records.....	243
Discussion	244
Methods	244
Age and sex composition	244
Birth rate	245
Death rates, malaria and malaria control	245
Population movements.....	247
Summary	248
 CHAPTER 9. CLINICAL SURVEYS	
Nutritional anthropometry	251
Spleen surveys	253
Temperature surveys.....	253
Population, study design and methods	253
Results	255
Discussion	257
Nutritional anthropometric surveys	257

CONTENTS

	Page
Spleen rates	257
Temperature surveys	258
Summary	258
CHAPTER 10. THE MATHEMATICAL MODEL OF TRANSMISSION	
The assumptions of the model	262
Epidemiological states and transitions	262
Superinfection	265
Dynamics of the human population	266
Vectorial capacity and inoculation rate	267
Equations of the model	268
Fitting of the model	270
Data selected for fitting	270
Estimation of model parameters	272
Testing of the model	273
Method of evaluation	273
Testing of the model against observations made in Garki before and during the application of propoxur	274
Testing of the model against observations made in Kisumu before and after the application of fenitrothion	277
Determination of the endemic level by the vectorial capacity	281
Variants of the model	283
Note on the computer programmes	283
Discussion	284
The model and reality	284
The present model and others	285
The model and the planning of malaria control	286
The model and the teaching of the epidemiology of malaria	287
Summary	287
CHAPTER 11. PRACTICAL CONCLUSIONS FOR THE FUTURE OF MALARIA CONTROL	
The control of malaria in the Sudan savanna of Africa	290
Residual insecticides	290

CONTENTS

	Page
The combination of mass drug administration with residual insecticides	292
Selective chemotherapy and chemoprophylaxis.....	293
The use of the malaria transmission model for the planning of malaria control	294
References	297
Acknowledgements	307
Appendix 1. Staffing of the Project	308
Appendix 2. Cost of the Project	311

FOREWORD

Malaria is undoubtedly one of the worst scourges of tropical Africa. The intensity of malaria transmission, although not uniform all over the continent, has been considered the main obstacle to any type of control of the disease for some years past. In 1934 James, a well-known British malariologist, suggested that in Africa young children should not be treated for their first attack of malaria so that they could develop some immunity. Similarly, famous malariologists like Swellengrebel maintained that, in areas with holoendemic (stable) malaria, man should not interfere with the established premunition of the human population since that would increase the severity of the clinical manifestations of malaria and the mortality caused by it in older children and adults. In fact, because of the presumed intensity of transmission, in addition to the lack of health infrastructure, Africa was not included in the global malaria eradication programme which was initiated by the World Health Organization in the mid 1950s.

The excellent results obtained elsewhere with DDT house-spraying in interrupting malaria transmission encouraged the initiation of more than 20 pilot projects in various African countries during the mid 1950s and early 1960s. In some countries, particularly in forested areas, the impression was that transmission could be interrupted if total coverage with insecticides and full surveillance were carried out. However, in none of these pilot projects were quantified epidemiological data collected in the course of operations that would have permitted a proper appreciation of the intensity of endemo-epidemicity and thus facilitated the planning of malaria control, particularly for the dry savanna areas.

In the light of the experience gained from pilot projects and in view of the insufficient knowledge and understanding of the quantitative dynamics of malaria transmission and of the impact of such control measures as residual house spraying and mass drug administration, WHO decided to initiate field research to provide information on all the factors that contribute to the maintenance of intensive transmission. The northern part of Nigeria was favoured for this research, Garki District was selected, and thus the project described in these pages was born.

When the research project was drawn up, it was decided to invest rather more resources than previously in the collection of baseline data and in the evaluation of the impact of house spraying with an effective residual

insecticide, alone or in combination with mass drug administration. The development of a mathematical model of transmission and its testing against hard data were part of this effort of understanding: if one could simulate realistically the transmission of malaria, one would presumably be closer to a balanced understanding of the interplay between the factors involved and better equipped for planning future control programmes. The Garki project also provided an unique opportunity to study a battery of seroimmunological tests before, during and after the application of control measures. The research project was designed to be limited in time, rather than as a pilot project to try out on a small scale a strategy that would later be applied on a large scale and over a prolonged period of time. It was essential to know what could or could not be achieved and, as far as possible, to find out why that was so; and it was therefore considered justified to apply control measures and methods of supervision that were more expensive than would be acceptable in a control programme. Great care was taken to protect the population involved from any untoward effect of the application of more or less intensive control measures over a short time; in the event, one of the results of the project was an increased awareness and a new understanding of malaria by the population and, with that, the adoption of self-medication, which is probably one of the most immediately applicable ways of reducing morbidity and mortality from malaria in a situation of the sort encountered in Garki.

The project largely reached its objectives, as this monograph shows. While several of the more striking results have been published elsewhere in a fragmentary way, in the present work the authors have aimed at a balanced account of all aspects of the study. The wealth of data collected did not make this easy. Some of the interpretations may be even challenged. The original data, collected with exceptional and meticulous care, are stored on tape and could be made accessible upon request to allow further or different methods of analysis.

This is not the place to summarize the project, but some of the findings may be highlighted here. First of all, a very high intensity of transmission was demonstrated: the vectorial capacity, which is an expression of the likelihood of transmission of the parasite, was about a thousand times the critical value required for the maintenance of endemic malaria; the entomological inoculation rate, or number of infections offered to man per unit of time, was about a hundred times the critical value. These very high levels of transmission put malaria in tropical Africa in a category of its own. The variations observed in the intensity of transmission from year to year and from village to village were well documented. Residual spraying with propoxur did not have the expected effect on the prevalence of malaria. The care with which both the control operations and the evaluation were conducted allow some firm conclusions: coverage was as

nearly complete as possible; the insecticide was very effective against the mosquito vectors (still producing a high mortality among them at the beginning of the third wet season after the last application!), although less so in reducing malaria; immigration of vectors or humans from unsprayed villages was not a significant factor. The decisive factors were the exophily of a fraction of the *Anopheles gambiae* sensu lato and a high man-biting rate—hence the high level of transmission. The same factors are also the main reason why the addition of mass drug administration, even at high frequency and coverage, while it reduced malaria to a very low level, failed to interrupt transmission. Variations in the degree of exophily between villages and between Garki and Kisumu, Kenya (where a quite distinct field trial of fenitrothion was conducted), explain the variations between villages in the effect of propoxur and most of the difference between the effect of the insecticides used in Garki and in Kisumu. Cytogenetic investigations pointed to a genetic basis for variation in resting behaviour within each of the two species of the *A. gambiae* complex occurring in Garki, and their results correlated well with the differences between villages in the effect of propoxur. If the resting behaviour of a mosquito species is genetically determined, exophily will be a stable characteristic of individual vectors, and the usual method of interpreting the impact of residual insecticides on longevity, which tacitly assumes uniform behaviour, is overoptimistic. Turning to the parasitological observations, the longitudinal nature of the study made it possible to show that everybody was infected early in life, not only by *Plasmodium falciparum*, but very probably also by *P. malariae*, and even by *P. ovale*, commonly described as a “rare” parasite. The effect of parasitism on immunity was well demonstrated, confirming much that was known but also producing some findings that either are new or were hitherto much less well documented. The seroimmunological study also yielded significant findings regarding the relationship between the various serological tests and parasitological findings, regarding the differences in immune response between males and females, between persons with and without the sickling trait, and between individuals, and regarding the effect of a drastic reduction in antigenic stimulation on the test results. The clinical studies, although limited in scope, demonstrated interesting relationships between body temperature and parasitaemia, and a significant effect of malaria control on the frequency of fever and on anthropometric indicators of the nutritional status of children. The demographic studies demonstrated that the infant mortality rate was very high before control, that its variation between years and between seasons was strikingly associated with the corresponding variations of the infant’s risk of acquiring *P. falciparum*, and that it was significantly reduced by malaria control. Last but not least, the new mathematical model, painstakingly tested

against hard facts, allows much more realistic simulations of the epidemiology of malaria, both before and after the application of control measures, than was previously possible.

The future will tell whether the volume, quality and relevance of the information produced by the project have justified the relatively high investment. There are implications for the future as regards control, teaching and research. The control of malaria in the African savanna will benefit from careful consideration of the observations made in Garki, even the negative ones; it is better to know your enemy's (malaria's) strength and resilience. Control of malaria on a broader scale will benefit from the addition to our planning tools of a new, more realistic, simulation model. The data from Garki, their interpretation (even when it is controversial), and simulation exercises based on the model will add to the materials available for teaching the epidemiology of malaria. Future field research should benefit directly from the experience, good and bad, gained in the project, and some of the findings mentioned above may also give leads for basic research.

The project was made possible by the dedication and hard work of many, in Nigeria and outside, in WHO, and in numerous national scientific institutions; they are listed in an appendix. Whatever the merit of the work, it is shared by all involved, and in particular by the members of the team in Nigeria, working hard and productively, often in very difficult conditions, and by the population of the Garki District, without whose superb and lasting cooperation none of this would have been possible. It is hoped that they and their descendants, and similarly affected populations, will reap the real benefits.

Dr T. LEPES
*Director, Malaria Action Programme,
World Health Organization*